

**SALT LAKE CITY
PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
In Room 315 of the City & County Building
451 South State Street, Salt Lake City, Utah
Wednesday, August 13, 2008**

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were Chair Matthew Wirthlin, Vice Chair Mary Woodhead and Commissioners: Robert Forbis, Peggy McDonough, Susie McHugh, Babs De Lay, Kathy Scott, and Prescott Muir. Commissioners Tim Chambless and Frank Algarin were excused from the meeting.

Present from the Planning Division: Orion Goff, Director of Building Services and Licensing; Paul Nielson, Senior City Attorney; Lynn Pace, Deputy City Attorney; Noel Walkingshaw, Senior Planner; Lex Traughber, Senior Planner; Doug Dansie, Senior Planner; Everett Joyce, Senior Planner; Kevin Young, Transportation Planning Engineer; Kathryn Weiler, Acting Planning Commission Secretary.

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. Chair Wirthlin called the meeting to order at 5:47 p.m. Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

A field trip was held prior to the meeting. Planning Commissioners present were: Babs De Lay, Peggy McDonough, Susie McHugh, Kathy Scott, Prescott Muir, and Mary Woodhead. Staff present was Everett Joyce and Doug Dansie.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES from Wednesday, July 9, 2008.

(This item was heard at [5:45:17 PM](#) View: ([PC Minutes July 30, 2008](#)).

([5:47:58 PM](#)) Commissioner Muir made a motion to approve the minutes with noted changes. Commissioner McDonough seconded the motion. All in favor voted, “Aye,” the motion passed unanimously. Commissioner McHugh abstained.

([5:48:59 PM](#)) Commissioner Muir and members of the Commission made additional comments regarding the minutes.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

(This item was heard at [5:52:05 PM](#)).

Mr. Walkingshaw agreed to give an Accela demonstration during the dinner hour of the next regular meeting of the Planning Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING

([5:53:00 PM](#)) Mayor Ralph Becker is developing an Executive Order for the expedited plan review for new construction and major renovation projects that meet certain sustainable building criteria. The purpose of this Executive Order is to provide incentives for “green” building. The proposed initiatives will be available to developers who agree in advance to meet and/or exceed the “Silver” level of LEED certification or achieve the standards required for an ENERGY STAR rating for homes. Mayor Becker is expected to sign the Executive Order on or about August 28, 2008. Staff is briefing the Planning Commission and will accept comments. (Staff: Orion Goff 535-6681 or orion.goff@slcgov.com and Nole Walkingshaw 535-7128 or nole.walkingshaw@slcgov.com). View: ([Memorandum](#)) View: ([Traffic Operations Addendum](#))

No action was required by the Planning Commission.

([6:02:58 PM](#)) Continued from the July 30, 2008 meeting; Petition 430-07-04, Granite Furniture Block/Craig Mecham Conditional Building and Site Design Review—a request for a new mixed-use development located at approximately 2100 South and 1100 East in the Sugar House Business District (CSHBD1 Zone) consisting of

commercial/office/retail and residential uses. The proposal involves construction of two new buildings with underground parking. This project is being reviewed by the Planning Commission due to the proposed building height and floor area. Buildings in the CSHBD1 that exceed fifty feet (50') in height or 20,000 square feet in size are subject to the Conditional Building and Site Design Review process. The Planning Commission has decision making authority in these matters. The property is located in City Council District Seven, represented by Søren Simonsen (Staff contact: Lex Traugher at 535-6184 or lex.traugher@slcgov.com). [View: \(Staff Report\)](#)

The public hearing portion of this item took place on July 30, 2008.

The following people submitted hearing cards in opposition to the proposal: **Kristina Heintz and Rawlins Young.**

[\(6:29:24 PM\)](#) Commissioner Muir disclosed to the Commission that he had participated in an ex-parte conversation with Jack Hammond regarding the case prior to the date of the hearing. He disclosed the content of the conversation and stated that this communication did not alter his ability to consider the petition in an unbiased manner.

Chair Wirthlin invited the applicant to answer questions from the Commission.

[\(7:05:04 PM\)](#) **Commissioner Woodhead made a motion regarding Petition 430-07-04 to approve Phase one of the proposal based upon the initial staff report dated July 30, 2008, the follow up staff report dated August 13, 2008, the testimony during the public hearing, and additional written materials submitted during this meeting, and also subject to the following conditions:**

1. **Compliance with the departmental comments as outlined in this staff report.**
2. **A preliminary subdivision application must be filed.**
3. **Any substantive changes in the proposed building plans due to issues with the Jordan and Salt Lake City Canal will require re-review by the Planning Commission.**
4. **The Planning Commission delegate's final approval of signage and lighting design to Planning Staff to ensure compliance with the "Business District Design Guideline Handbook" located in the Sugar House Community Master Plan.**
5. **The developer complies with the conditions set forth for traffic mitigation. Memorandum authored by Kevin Young dated August 7, 2008 that the developer comply with the standards stated on pages 8-10 of the staff report for conditional and site design in compliance with the Sugarhouse Design Standards.**
6. **Build to LEED certification as acknowledged and agreed to by the Developer.**

Amended by Commissioner McDonough

7. **That the ground level of the West façade be structurally designed to easily accommodate modification or conversion for a retail store front in the future if the pedestrian mall is created along the canal easement.**

Amended by Commissioner Muir

8. **Phase one design is approved intact with the proviso that Phase II of the project would be conditioned to close the entry between 1100 East and the entry to the parking structure to auto traffic and become a pedestrian way.**

Commissioner Woodhead accepted the amendments to the motion.

Commissioner De Lay seconded the motion.

All in favor voted, "Aye," the motion carried unanimously.

Commissioner McDonough made a request that the Salt Lake City Transportation Division, at one year post construction of Phase I, provide the Commission with recommendations on possible mitigation for residential streets surrounding the subject site.

Chair Wirthlin called for a break at 7:11 p.m.

Chair Wirthlin reconvened the meeting at 7:20 p.m.

[\(7:20:22 PM\)](#) **Petition 410-08-37 Planned development, Symphony at Gateway**—a request for a planned development by Western States Lodging to construct a 263 unit apartment complex. The property is located at approximately 536 West 100 South, in the Gateway mixed-use zoning district (GMU) in Council District Four, represented by Luke Garrott (Staff contact: Doug Dansie 535-6182 or doug.dansie@slcgov.com)

View: [\(Staff Report\)](#)

[\(7:41:50 PM\)](#) The following people spoke or submitted hearing cards in opposition to the proposed petition: **Christian Harrison**, Downtown Community Council.

[\(7:58:07 PM\)](#) Commissioner De Lay made a motion based upon the comments, findings of fact, testimony, and findings within the staff report, to approve the proposal subject to the following conditions:

1. The site (including the park strip) must be irrigated with an automatic sprinkling system.
2. The applicant shall comply with all City Department and Division conditions as stated in this Staff Report.
3. The applicant shall show on the final plat a trash removal plan for the project.
4. The developer will sign a SID waiver *or install curb and gutter at the time that final street grades are determined.*

Seconded by Commissioner Forbis

Amendment posed by Commissioner Scott:

Condition 4 should read, *the developer signs a SID waiver with Salt Lake City with the understanding that improvements to the curb and gutter be made at the time that UDOT completes the off ramp.*

The amendment was not accepted.

Amendment posed by Commissioner De Lay:

The developer will sign a SID waiver or install curb and gutter at the time that final street grades are determined.

Amendment posed by Commissioner McDonough:

5. The residential units that face 100 South at grade are to have an exterior skin designed with a panel that either is or would be replaced with an operational door now or in the future, but the framing for the door to be in place.

Commissioner Forbis accepted the amendments to the motion.

All in favor voted, “Aye,” Commissioner Woodhead voted, “No”. The motion carried.

[\(8:01:11PM\)](#) **Petition 410-08-44 Planned development, Saxton Grove Townhomes**—a request by Intermountain Home Solutions. The property is located at approximately 321 and 365 South 870 West, in the Moderate Density Multi-Family Residential District (RMF-35), in Council District Two, represented by Van Turner (Staff contact: Doug Dansie 535-6182 or doug.dansie@slcgov.com). View: [\(Staff Report\)](#)

Commissioner Scott recused herself.

The following people spoke or submitted hearing cards in opposition to the proposed petition: **Leanna White**.

The following people spoke or submitted hearing cards in support to the proposed petition: **Sandy Stewart**.

(8:29:46 PM) Commissioner Muir made a motion to table the petition to allow the developer to redesign the proposal and return before the Planning Commission. The applicant has the option of submitting the new design before a subcommittee before submitting it before the Commission.

Seconded by Commissioner Forbis.

Commissioner McDonough requested specific direction on behalf of staff and the developer.

Commissioner Muir amended his motion to include:

- 1. The redesign is to accommodate a fee simple zero lot line ownership configuration to minimize the amount of asphalt.**
- 2. The applicant and staff are to consider tandem parking structure vs. surface visitor parking.**

Amendment accepted by Commissioner Forbis.

All voted, “Aye,” the motion carried unanimously.

Commissioner Scott returned to the meeting.

(8:37:44 PM) **Petition 410-08-16 Planned development, Carriage Court**—a request by ADC Corporation for a Planned Development to construct three twin homes on a common lot. The property is located at located at 2734 South 1000 East. The property is located in a SR-1 Special Development Pattern Residential District and is accessed from Forest View Avenue. The property is located in Council District Seven, represented by Soren Simonsen (Staff contact: Doug Dansie 535-6182 or doug.dansie@slcgov.com). **View:** ([Staff Report](#))

The following people spoke or submitted hearing cards in opposition to the proposed petition: **Al Acker, Richard Belew, Julie Bone, Barbara Butterworth, Jeannine P. Coon, Jose Corea, Kareen Corea, Scott Currey, Mark Holyoak, Bunny Keele, Keslee Keele, John Nilsson, Kim Slaymaker and John Tronier.**

(9:33:06 PM) Commissioner Muir made a motion regarding **Petition 410-08-16**, based upon the comments, analysis, and findings of fact in the staff report, and testimony heard, the Planning Commission grants **Planned Development approval subject to the following conditions:**

- 1. An attempt is made to salvage the old carriage house or donate it to a museum that will use it as part of their display (plans for the Carriage House to be moved or salvaged be reviewed by the Historic Landmark Commission Staff).**
- 2. The applicant shall comply with all City Department and Division conditions as stated in this staff report.**
- 3. Prior to relocating or demolishing the carriage house, the developer provides archival documentation to be submitted to the Utah State Historical Preservation Office.**
- 4. Designated trash pickup area on the site.**
- 5. The carriage house lot 6 be delayed in a phased approach, so that the developer make every effort to try to save the carriage house and that the developer develops a schematic design that demonstrates how the carriage house could be used as the sixth unit, and only as a last resort would the structure be demolished through demonstration to staff that the developer had no other recourse.**

6. All visitor parking moved to 1000 East, and the front yard condition on visitor parking be waived. Developer should also provide pedestrian access to all units to the visitor parking.
7. Unit number one be reconfigured to be more tailored to the lay of the land, to avoid a large unoccupied basement wall on the west on the structure.

Commissioner Scott seconded the motion.

Amendment posed by Commissioner McDonough:

That both units five and six be delayed, in order to preserve the carriage house

Commissioner Muir did not accept the amendment, explaining that his assumption was that unit five could be moved over with some adjustment as directed by the Planning Director, on the configuration of visitor parking and the location of unit 5, such that it would accommodate the later options for unit six.

Amendment posed by Commissioner Scott:

(Recommendation) The Salt Lake City Arborist evaluates the cottonwood trees.

Commissioner Muir accepted this amendment.

Amendment posed by Commissioner Scott:

To remove the word *try* in condition 5 from the sentence, *to try to save the carriage house*, to make this statement stronger.

Commissioner Muir did not accept this amendment, believing, *as a last resort* at the end of the condition was adequate.

Mr. Nielson stated that Commissioner Muir should consider amending condition 8 as a recommendation that the City Arborist evaluate the trees rather than require the City Arborist to evaluate the trees, which may create an unnecessary burden on the applicant.

Commissioner Muir stated he would change the motion to reflect that this be a recommendation, and that this decision be facilitated by the Planning Director and the City Arborist.

All in favor voted, "Aye," Commissioner De Lay voted, "No".

[\(9:41:44 PM\)](#) Commissioner Forbis inquired if there was a way to initiate a petition to investigate how to address environmental issues.

The Commission agreed that a retreat should be scheduled to address planning issues with the new Planning Director.

The meeting adjourned at 9:46 p.m.

This document, along with the digital recording, constitute the official minutes of the Salt Lake City Planning Commission held on August 13, 2008.

Tami Hansen